



March 30, 2022

Mr. Brian Helminger
District Director
HOVMSD
801 Thilmany Road
Kaukauna, WI 54130

Re: Letter of Recommendation and Contract Award
Heart of the Valley Metropolitan Sewerage District
Wastewater Treatment Facility Effluent Filtration Improvements
Donohue Project No. 13649

Dear Mr. Helminger:

According to the Advertisement for Bids, sealed bids for the above-referenced project were received virtually on Thursday, March 24, 2022, at 1:00 p.m, Central Daylight Standard Time, and then opened and read aloud. Two bids were received. The Bid Tabulation is provided in the table below. Donohue reviewed the bids and found no errors in how they were completed.

Bid Opening	1	2
Company Name	C.D. Smith Construction, Inc.	Miron Construction Co., Inc.
Lump-Sum Base Bid Price (\$)	\$15,824,000.00	\$16,315,109.00
Alternative 1 Price (\$)	\$671,000.00	\$674,364.00
Acknowledge Receipt of Addenda (4 issued)	Yes	Yes
Bid Security	Yes	Yes
Subcontractor Listing Provided	Yes	Yes
Bid Executed	Yes	Yes
Base Bid Material and Equipment Schedule Completed	Yes	Yes
Disclosure of Ownership	Yes	Yes
EPA Form 8700-294	Yes	Yes
DBE Contacts Worksheet	Yes	Yes
EPA Form 6100-4	Yes	Yes

The low lump-sum base bid price, including allowances, was submitted by C.D. Smith Construction, Inc. of Fond du Lac, WI, in the amount of \$15,824,000.00. The second-lowest lump-sum base bid price, including allowances, was submitted by Miron Construction Co., Inc. of Neenah, WI, in the amount of \$16,315,109.00. Donohue's opinion of the probable construction cost for the project base bid was \$13,300,000. The low base bid amount was approximately \$2,404,000 (15.3%) more than our estimate of probable construction cost.

The bidding documents included one Alternate. If Alternate 1 is selected, then the lowest bid price will be determined by adding the base bid plus the Alternate bid.. Alternate 1 is described below.

Alternate 1 – Disc Filter 6

This alternate provides Disc Filter 6, including Backwash Pump, Drive, and Local Control Panel, and associated piping, fittings, valves, supports, electrical, and controls. C.D. Smith Construction, Inc. offered a \$671,000 adder for including this alternate. Miron Construction Co., Inc. offered a \$674,364 adder for including this alternate. After discussing with HOVMSD staff, the team decided this work is necessary to improve the effluent filtration system's current and anticipated future operation. The addition of a redundant unit provides more flexibility to take filters on and off line for operations and maintenance. Also, the additional filter area provided by the additional unit further increases the effective filter surface area, improving filtration during high flow and periods of high chemical usage. Donohue recommends accepting Alternate 1.

The lowest overall bid price, which is the sum of the base bid price plus the price of Alternate 1, was submitted by C.D. Smith Construction, Inc. in the amount of \$16,495,000.00. The second-lowest overall bid price was submitted by Miron Construction Co., Inc. in the amount of \$16,989,473.00.

It is our opinion that the low bidder, C.D. Smith Construction, Inc., submitted a responsive bid and is also qualified and capable of performing the work as specified.

It is, therefore, Donohue's recommendation to award the project to C.D. Smith Construction, Inc.

Based on Donohue's recommendation of accepting bid Alternate 1, the recommended contract award amount is \$16,495,000.00.

We are presenting this evaluation and recommendation for your review and consideration and will be pleased to answer any questions you have concerning the information provided herein.

Sincerely,



Ryan Holzem, P.E.
Project Manager

Copy: Mike Gerbitz, Donohue